

Microbiological Quality of Mixed Fresh-Cut Vegetable Salads and Mixed Ready- to-Eat Fresh Herbs in Mashhad, Iran

Mohammad B. Habibi Najafi⁺ and M. Bahreini¹

Department of Food Science & Technology, Faculty of Agriculture, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, P. O. Box 91775-1163 Mashhad, Iran

Abstract. This study aimed to determine the microbiological quality of mixed fresh-cut vegetable salads and mixed ready-to-eat fresh herbs produced in Mashhad, Iran. A total of 174 samples including 89 mixed fresh-cut vegetable salads and 85 mixed ready-to-eat fresh herbs were collected between July 2010 and March 2011. Samples were analyzed for aerobic plate counts, coliforms, enterobacteriaceae, *Escherichia coli*, *Escherichia coli* O157:H7, *Salmonella* spp., *Staphylococcus aureus*, and yeast and mold counts.

The incidence levels of aerobic plate count bacteria indicated that 50.6% of mixed ready-to-eat fresh herbs and 49.4% of mixed fresh-cut vegetable salads contained less than 107 cfu/g. Enterobacteriaceae and total coliform levels ranged from 3 log cfu/g to 8.3 log cfu/g. Lactic acid bacteria were present in mixed fresh-cut vegetable salads and mixed ready-to-eat fresh herbs at 5.9 log cfu/g and 4.88 log cfu/g respectively. Yeasts and molds were found in mixed fresh-cut vegetable salads and mixed ready-to-eat fresh herbs at 5.68 log cfu/g and 5.78 log cfu/g respectively. Yeasts and molds at ≤ 5 log cfu/g were recovered from 42.7% (38 of 89 samples) and 40% (34 of 85 samples) of mixed fresh-cut vegetable salads and mixed ready-to-eat fresh herbs respectively. While 19.1% of mixed fresh-cut vegetable salads and 27.8% mixed ready-to-eat fresh herbs contained *E. coli*, only 6.3% of all samples were contaminated with the microorganism at ≥ 2 log cfu/g. *E. coli* O157:H7 was detected in mixed fresh-cut vegetable salads and mixed ready-to-eat fresh herbs with an incidence of 6.5% and 11.4% respectively. *Staphylococcus aureus* was found in 94.9% of samples, whereas coagulase-positive staphylococci were detected in 23.6% of samples. Our results also exhibited that 9.4% of mixed ready-to-eat fresh herbs and 5.6% of mixed fresh-cut vegetable salads were contaminated with *Salmonella* spp.

Keywords: Mixed fresh-cut vegetable salads; Minimally processed vegetables; Microbiological quality; Incidence levels; Enteric pathogens.

1. Introduction

Demand for fresh-cut and mixed ready to eat vegetables has been increased in recent years, due to the nutritional value as well as health benefits. Different organizations (WHO, FAO, USDA, EFSA) recommend the increasing fruits and vegetables consumption to decrease the risk of some diseases such as cardiovascular and cancer (1). Fresh-cut vegetables are considered to be as a vehicle for the transmission of food-borne pathogens and a number of reports refer to raw vegetables harbouring potential food borne pathogens (2, 3). There have been a number of reports on microbiological quality of fresh-cut and mixed ready to eat vegetables from different parts of the world (4, 5, and 6). To the best of authors' knowledge, there have been no previous studies examined the microbiological quality of mixed fresh-cut vegetables and mixed ready-to-eat fresh herbs in Iran, despite the fact that the number of vegetable processing plants have rapidly being increased. The aim of this study was to investigate the microbiological quality of mixed fresh-cut vegetable salads and mixed ready-to-eat fresh herbs in Mashhad, Iran.

2. Materials and Methods

⁺ Corresponding author.
E-mail address: habibi@um.ac.ir

2.1. Sampling

Totally 174 samples of mixed fresh-cut vegetables and mixed ready-to-eat fresh herbs were analyzed between July 2010 and March 2011. Samples were transported in an ice box to the laboratory where they were analyzed for spoilage and pathogenic microorganisms within 2 h of sample collection.

Twenty five grams of each sample was added to 225 ml of buffered peptone water (BPW) and blended vigorously for 2 min at normal speed in a kitchen blender (Sanyo, Japan). Serial decimal dilutions of the suspension were then prepared in BPW before performing the analysis.

2.2. Microbiological Analysis

Aerobic mesophilic bacteria were counted by pour plating method on plate count agar and were incubated at 30° C for 48 h. Enterobacteriaceae and total coliforms were enumerated on violet red bile glucose agar (VRBG) and violet red bile lactose agar (VRBL), respectively, by pour plate method with an over layer, followed by incubation at 30° C for 24 h. The red colonies were counted.

Lactic acid bacteria count (LAB) was done by pour plating method with an over layer on MRS agar and were incubated at 30° C for 48 h.

Yeasts and molds were counted by pour plating method on YGC agar, followed by incubation at 25° C for 3-5 days.

Staphylococcus aureus was isolated and enumerated by pour plating onto Baird-Parker agar containing egg yolk emulsion and incubated at 35° C for 24 h. Two or three of black colonies were selected and tested for catalase test, gram reaction and coagulase reaction.

E. coli was enumerated using chromagarECC (trypton bile X- glucouronide agar) (Chromagar Co., France) by incubation at 30° C and 44° C for 24 h. The blue-green colonies were counted as *E. coli*. Isolated *E. coli* on chromagar ECC was sub-cultured onto Cefixime-Tellurite Sorbitol MacConkey agar (CT-SMAC) (Merck Co., Germany) at 37° C for 24 h. Colorless colonies on the CT-SMAC agar were tested for *E. coli* O157:H7 by latex agglutination test.

To investigate of *Salmonella* spp., the blended samples in BPW were incubated at 37° C for 20-24 h. *Salmonella* spp. were then enrichment in Rappaport-Vassiliadis enrichment broth (RVS) and tetrathionat broth containing iodine solution and neobiocin (40 µg/ml) at 41.5° C for 24 h. After 18-24 h, samples were then streaked on xylose lysine desoxycholate (XLD) (Merck co., Germany), Bismuth sulfite iron agar (BSI) (Merck co., Germany) and brilliant green agar (BGA) and incubated at 37° C for 24-48 h. Two or more identical colonies were then transferred to lysine iron agar, triple sugar iron agar slants and urease broth. Each culture showing presumptive-positive results was maintained on Brain heart infusion agar. Cultures were further subjected to serological tests using polyvalent O and H antisera.

3. Results

Microbial quality and the distribution incidence levels of all analyzed samples are presented in Tables 1 and 2. The aerobic plate count (APC) were ranged from 4.1 log cfu/g to 8.3 log cfu/g in mixed fresh-cut salads and from 4.3 log cfu/g to 8.3 log cfu/g in mixed green leaves vegetables. The microbial load of 44.9% of mixed fresh-cut salads and 43.5% of mixed green leaves vegetables was in the range of 7 log cfu/g to 8 log cfu/g.

Enterobacteriaceae counts were ranged between 3 log cfu/g to 8.3 log cfu/g for mixed fresh-cut salads and from 3.1 log cfu/g to 7 log cfu/g for mixed green leaves vegetables. The highest incidence levels on mixed fresh-cut salads and mixed green leaves vegetables were 42.7% and 32.9% respectively with the load between 5 log cfu/g to 6 log cfu/g.

Total coliforms were between 3.9 log cfu/g to 7.48 log cfu/g for mixed fresh-cut salads and 3.2 log cfu/g to 7 log cfu/g for mixed green leaves vegetables. 50.6% and 49.4% of all mixed fresh-cut salads and mixed green leaves vegetables fell in a range between 5 log cfu/g to 6 log cfu/g.

Lactic acid bacteria (LAB) were ranged from 1 log cfu/g to 7.3 log cfu/g on mixed fresh-cut salads and from 1 log cfu/g to 6 log cfu/g on mixed green leaves vegetables. 87.8% of all mixed green leaves vegetables

were found to be in a range less than 5 log cfu/g, whereas only 44.4% of mixed fresh-cut salad samples have found in that range.

Yeasts and molds counts were between 3.85 log cfu/g to 6.7 log cfu/g for mixed fresh-cut salads and 2.04 log cfu/g to 6.6 log cfu/g for mixed green leaves vegetables. The highest overall incidence levels were ranged between 5 log cfu/g to 6 log cfu/g for mixed fresh-cut salads (43.8%) and mixed green leaves vegetables (36.5%).

E. coli was detected in 19.1% of mixed fresh-cut salads and 27.8% of mixed green leaves vegetables. 6.3% of all mixed green leaves vegetables and mixed fresh-cut salads (five samples each), had *E. coli* counts ≥ 2 log cfu/g. However, mixed green leaves vegetables had higher incidence levels than the mixed fresh-cut salads.

E. coli O157:H7 was detected in 6.5% of mixed fresh-cut salads and 11.4% of mixed green leaves vegetables. *S. aureus* was found in 94.9% of all samples. 77.1% of the positive samples had less than 4 log cfu/g and 23.6% of samples were positive to coagulase test. *Salmonella* spp. was detected in 5.6% and 9.4% of mixed fresh-cut salads and mixed green leaves vegetables, respectively.

4. Discussion

There is insufficient information available on the incidence levels and microbial quality of fresh-cut vegetables worldwide rather than Iran. This article is the first report on the incidence levels and microbial quality of mixed fresh-cut salads and mixed green leaves vegetables of Mashhad, Iran.

All examined samples were contaminated with total aerobic mesophiles (APC). The results showed that APC were less than 107 cfu/g in 49.4% mixed fresh-cut salads and 50.6% of mixed green leaves vegetables. Abadias et al. reported the similar results (4). Vegetable samples examined by Nguz et al., Johnston et al. and Seo et al. (5, 6, and 7) reported the means of APC ranged from 3.0 to 7.8 log cfu/g on restaurant prepared lettuce, 4.5 to 6.2 log cfu/g on fresh produces and 5.4 log cfu/g to 8.9 log cfu/g in mixed salads. Our results were almost in agreement with other researchers. High aerobic mesophilic counts found in samples may reflect the fact that poor handling, inappropriate processing or a general lack of hygiene is the main cause.

Our results revealed that 100% of mixed fresh-cut salads and mixed green leaves vegetables were contaminated with Enterobacteriaceae and total coliforms, and the level of contamination varied from 3 log cfu/g to 8.3 log cfu/g for Enterobacteriaceae and 3.2 log cfu/g to 7.48 log cfu/g for total coliforms. Abadias et al. and Nguz et al. found that the incidence levels of Enterobacteriaceae in whole vegetables and fresh-cut vegetables were 78.6% and 73.3% respectively (4, 5). Johnston et al. showed that total coliforms ranged from 1 to 4.3 log cfu/g on green leaves and herbs (6). Little et al. reported levels of total coliforms on fresh lettuce up to 5 log cfu/g (8) and Seo et al. found the range of total coliforms in mixed salad vegetables was from 2.7 log cfu/g to 8.2 log cfu/g (7).

Our data indicated that 19.1% of mixed fresh-cut salads and 27.8% mixed green leaves vegetables contained *E. coli*. But only 6.3% of samples are at higher than 2 log cfu/g. Abadias et al. reported that in 7.1% whole vegetables, 11.4% fresh-cut vegetables and 40% sprouts *E. coli* was presented (4) and Soriano et al. showed that 25.7% of restaurant prepared lettuce contained *E. coli* (9). Nguz et al. and Johnston et al. reported 40% fresh cut vegetables and all of leafy green and herbs contaminated with *E. coli* (5,6).

Many authors have not reported the presence of *E. coli* O157:H7 on fresh-cut vegetables, whereas we were able to detect it on fresh-cut and green leaves vegetables. The incidence levels of *E. coli* O157:H7 on mixed fresh-cut salads and mixed green leaves vegetables were 6.5% and 11.4%, respectively.

S. aureus is a pathogen known to be carried by food handlers (10). The presence of *S. aureus* in mixed fresh-cut vegetables indicated the poor hygiene practices and levels higher than 4 log cfu/g are potentially hazardous. According to our data, *S. aureus* was detected in 94.9% of samples and the levels of *S. aureus* in 77.1% samples were less than 4 log and coagulase-positive staphylococci were detected in 17.1% of samples. A few studies have reported the isolation of *S. aureus* from fresh-cut vegetables. Nguz et al. showed the incidence levels of *S. aureus* were 83.9% of products analyzed (5). Soriano et al. reported that coagulase-positive staphylococci were detected in approximately 22.9% of the samples (10).

Salmonella spp. as a pathogenic microorganism was detected in fresh-cut vegetables and raw vegetables in many countries with different incidence level and the findings were reported in their publications (4, 5, 6, and 7).

Our samples were contaminated with salmonella and incidence levels of salmonella on mixed fresh-cut salads and mixed green leaves vegetables were 5.6% and 9.4% respectively.

The role of yeasts and molds in the spoilage of mixed green leaves vegetables is not well documented and their growth on salads dose not lead to major problem. However, some of molds may produce mycotoxins and others are known to cause allergies when they produce large number of conidia, as a result the health problems may associated with the presence of them in fresh product (11).

Our results showed that the mean counts of yeasts and molds in mixed fresh-cut vegetables and mixed green leaves salads were 5.68 log cfu/g and 5.78 log cfu/g respectively. Others were also reported similar results. Tournas reported that yeasts on fresh and minimally processed vegetables and sprouts were ranged from 2 log cfu/g to 8.6 log cfu/g and molds counts ranged from less than 2 log cfu/g to 4.6 log cfu/g (11). Abadias et al. (4) and Seo et al. (7) reported the mean counts yeast and molds on fresh-cut vegetables 5.2 log cfu/g and 5.1 log cfu/g respectively.

Table 1: Overall incidence levels (%) of bacteria and yeasts and molds on mixed vegetable salad

	n	ND	<10 ²	10 ² -10 ³	10 ³ -10 ⁴	10 ⁴ -10 ⁵	10 ⁵ -10 ⁶	10 ⁶ -10 ⁷	10 ⁷ -10 ⁸	10 ⁸ -10 ⁹
Aerobic plate count	89		-	-	-	3.4	9	39.3	44.9	3.4
Enterobacteriaceae	89		-	-	3.4	25.8	40.5	25.8	3.4	1.1
Total coliform	89		-	-	2.3	28.1	46.1	17.9	5.6	-
Lactic acid bacteria	81		2.5	8.6	12.4	14.8	44.4	14.8	2.5	-
Yeasts & molds	89		-	-	2.3	37.1	46	14.6	-	-
<i>Staphylococcus aureus</i>	78	6.4	11.5	32.2	25.6	19.2	5.1	-	-	-
<i>E. coli</i>	80	81.2	12.5	6.3	-	-	-	-	-	-
<i>E. coli</i> O157:H7	80	93.5	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Salmonella spp.	89	100	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

n= Number of samples; ND= Not detected

Table 2: Overall incidence levels (%) of bacteria and yeasts and molds on mixed ready to eat vegetables

	n	ND	<10 ²	10 ² -10 ³	10 ³ -10 ⁴	10 ⁴ -10 ⁵	10 ⁵ -10 ⁶	10 ⁶ -10 ⁷	10 ⁷ -10 ⁸	10 ⁸ -10 ⁹
Aerobic plate count	85		-	-	-	2.4	14.1	34.1	43.5	5.9
Enterobacteriaceae	85		-	-	3.5	25.9	36.5	30.6	3.5	-
Total coliform	85		-	-	5.9	21.2	48.2	21.2	3.5	-
Lactic acid bacteria	82		2.4	12.2	35.4	35.4	12.2	2.4	-	-
Yeasts & molds	85		-	2.4	12.9	15.3	38.8	30.6	-	-
<i>Staphylococcus aureus</i>	80	3.8	12.3	21.3	51.3	11.3	-	-	-	-
<i>E. coli</i>	79	72.2	21.5	6.3	-	-	-	-	-	-
<i>E. coli</i> O157:H7	79	88.6	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Salmonella spp.	85	98.8	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

n= Number of samples; ND= Not detected

5. References

- [1] Allende, A., Tomas-Barberan, F. A., and Gil, M. I., 2006, Minimal processing for healthy traditional foods. Trends in Food Science and Technology. 17:513-519.
- [2] Beuchat, L. R., 1996. Pathogenic microorganism associated with fresh product. Journal of Food Protection 59:204-216.
- [3] Nguyen-the, C. and Carlin, F., 1994. The microbiology of minimally processed fresh fruits and vegetables. Critical reviews in food science and nutrition. 34: 371-401.
- [4] Abadias, M., Usall, J., Anguera, M., Solsona, C., and Vinas, I. 2008, Microbiological quality of fresh, minimally-processed fruit and vegetables, and sprouts from retail establishments. International Journal of Food Microbiology. 123:121-129.

- [5] Nguz, K., Shindano, J., Samapundo, S., and Huyghebaert, A., 2005. Microbiological evaluation of fresh-cut vegetables produced in Zambia. *Food Control*. 16: 623-628.
- [6] Johnston, L.M., Jaykus, L., Moll, D., Martinez, M.C., Anciso, J., Mora, B., and Moe, C.L., 2005. A field study on the microbiological quality of fresh produce. *Journal of Food Protection*. 68: 1840-1847.
- [7] Seo, Y. H., Jang, J. H., and Moon, K. W. (2010). Microbial evaluation of minimally processed vegetables and sprouts produced in Seoul, Korea. *Food Science Biotechnology*, 19 (5), 1283-1288.
- [8] Little, C.L., Roberts, D., Youngs, E., and de Louvouis, J., 1999. Microbiological quality of retail imported unprepared whole lettuce. A PHLS food working group study. *Journal of Food Protection*. 62: 325-328.
- [9] Soriano, J.M., Rico, H., Molto, J.C., and Manes, J., 2000. Assessment of the microbiological quality and wash treatments of lettuce served in university restaurants. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*. 58:123-128.
- [10] Beuchat, L.R., 1998. Surface decontamination of fruits and vegetables eaten raw: a review. WHO/FSF/FOS/98.2. Food Safety Unit. World Health Organization.
URL:http://www.who.int/foodsafety/publications/fs_management/en/surface_decon.pdf
- [11]] Tournas, V.H., 2005. Moulds and yeasts in fresh and minimally processed vegetables, and sprouts. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*. 99: 71-77.